Why is it so hard to see health benefits from genomic screening?

Alanna Kulchak Rahm, PhD, MS, CGC

Genome XV

November 9, 2023



Because....

- Access, increased participation in research, and increased testing are not enough
 - Engagement with the information by clinicians and affected individuals through care practice
- Multi-level Barriers and facilitators
 - Communication
 - Billing/Access to services
 - Ongoing engagement and codevelopment of programs



Implementing genomic information into care to achieve equitable and population-level health benefit is a multi-level issue

National policy/ Media/ External environment

Payers / Health plans

Healthcare System

Departments/ clinics/ teams

Providers

Family

Patient

Even if 100% effective, impact depends on:

(1) Adoption
(2) Training
(3) Fidelity (Implementation)
(4) Access (Reach)
(5) Sustainability (Maintenance)
50% threshold for each step= .5*.5*.5*.5=

3% benefit



The diminished overall effect of an intervention, process, guideline, test, drug, etc previously shown effective in a trial (a highly controlled environment) when utilized in the real world (an uncontrolled environment)



What is most relevant to the stakeholders?

Even if **genomic screening** was 100% effective at testing and identifying everyone in the population with a result, **health benefit** depends on:

If only **50%** of systems adopt practices to alert clinicians of medical management changes

& only **50%** clinicians work with individuals to change medical management

& only **50%** of individuals follow the guidelines



Adoption

Fidelity

The overall impact (health benefit) is reduced to 12.5% (.5*.5*.5)

IMPELEMENTATION SCIENCE.....

What works for who, when, and under what conditions/in what contexts



Graphic: Sidney Harris, The New Yorker Magazine

Consolidate Framework for Implementation Research (CFIR)



Damschroder LJ, Aron DC, Keith RE, Kirsh SR, Alexander JA, Lowery JC. Fostering implementation of health services research findings into practice: a consolidated framework for advancing implementation science. *Implement Sci.* 2009;**4**:1–15. doi: 10.1186/1748-5908-4-50

Engagement – a core component



Co-creation with those who will benefit most



Engagement across spectrum of Implementation



Mitigate biases from big data

Different Engagement Options For Different Preferences

There is a role for everyone. Find the role(s) that are right for you and get engaged.



Wagner JK, Peltz-Rauchman C, Rahm AK, Johnson CC. Precision engagement: the PMI's success will depend on more than genomes and big data. Genet Med. 2017 Jun;19(6):620-624. doi: 10.1038/gim.2016.165. Epub 2016 Oct 27. PMID: 27787499; PMCID: PMC5555824.

PCORI "Learning to Engage and Be Engaged (PI: Davis)

Importance of addressing equity to realize health benefits of genomic screening



- Lack of heterogeneity in the field and the patients/clients we serve
- Equitable benefit requires equitable implementation
- Equitable implementation does not mean "one size fits all"
- Structural, societal, and other multilevel factors impact implementation and exacerbate inequity when not identified and addressed

Recommended IS Components to Incorporate Equity into Precision Medicine and Public Health



Allen CG, Olstad DL, Kahkoska AR, et al. Extending an antiracism lens to the implementation of precision public health interventions. Am J Public Health. Published online ahead of print August 31, 2023:e1–e9

Shelton RC, Adsul P, Oh A, Moise N, Griffith DM. Application of an antiracism lens in the field of implementation science: recommendations for reframing implementation research with a focus on justice and racial equity. Implement Res Pract. 2021;2:1–19.

Addressing Context and Promoting Equity with RE-AIM

Shelton RC, Chambers DA, Glasgow RE. An Extension of RE-AIM to Enhance Sustainability: Addressing Dynamic Context and Promoting Health Equity Over Time. Front Public Health. 2020 May 12;8:134

Reach

- Are all reached equitably?
- Who is not reached?

Effectiveness

- Is health impact equitably experienced?
- Do certain groups experience higher burden or negative effect?

Addressing Context and Promoting Equity with RE-AIM

Shelton RC, Chambers DA, Glasgow RE. An Extension of RE-AIM to Enhance Sustainability: Addressing Dynamic Context and Promoting Health Equity Over Time. Front Public Health. 2020 May 12;8:134

Adoption

- Were low resource settings able to adopt?
- What adaptation is needed to facilitate adoption?

Implementation

- Who did not deliver the program and why?
- Did all have the capacity/resources to implement?

Maintenance

- Is the program equitably maintained?
- Are long-term outcomes equally experienced?
- Do all settings have capacity /resources to maintain the program over time?



Population Screening Pilot: Adoption & Implementation

What is the ADOPTION of population screening among providers to whom it is available and how consistently do they use it?

- Test available to all patients in 3 self-selected clinics (1 per region)
- Clinics trained and provided EHR tools for documentation/ordering
- 56 clinicians ordered at least one test
- One physician = 462 orders
- One Physician = 142 orders
- Another 8 clinicians ordered between 13 – 32 tests

Authorizing provider type	Number of Providers		
	Clinic 1	Clinic 2	Clinic 3
Physician	20	3	4
Resident / Fellow	17	NA	9
Mid-level provider	2	NA	1

Jones LK, Strande NT, Calvo EM, Chen J, Rodriguez G, McCormick CZ, Hallquist MLG, Savatt JM, Rocha H, Williams MS, Sturm AC, Buchanan AH, Glasgow RE, Martin CL, Rahm AK. A RE-AIM Framework Analysis of DNA-Based Population Screening: Using Implementation Science to Translate Research Into Practice in a Healthcare System. Front Genet. 2022 May 25;13:883073. doi: 10.3389/fgene.2022.883073. PMID: 35692820; PMCID: PMC9174580.

EXAMPLE - Cross-Cutting Needs for Patient Stakeholders

Education, understanding, and facilitation of insurance coverage for screening colonoscopy Comparative effectiveness research on screening intervals and start/stop based on age or genotype

COLON CANCER

98

Research in LS patients on alternate screening tests, effective treatments, and cancer vaccines

REAR IN GEAR





Traceback interventions (in process)

UXXXX PI: Rahm, Henrikson, Jonas

Geisinger



Identify eligible patients



Outreach via letter / patient portal



Reminder calls, scheduling from genetic counseling assistant



Usual care for counseling, testing, follow-up, cascade testing

KP Mid-Atlantic States



Identify eligible patients



Outreach via letter / patient portal



ğ

Reminder calls, genetic test order from nurse

Usual care for counseling, testing, follow-up, cascade testing (link to video)



Nurse: family sharing calls, video

KP Washington



Identify eligible patients



Outreach via mailed letter from KWPA genetics ± link to video



Outreach, reminder call(s), scheduling from **KPWA** genetics



Usual care for counseling, testing, follow-up, cascade testing

Implementation Science in a Nutshell with Engagement and Equity

Curran GM. Implement SciCommun. 2020



THE

THING



Does THE THING Work

Co-create with stakeholders

Are benefits experienced differently? What we do to help people/ places **DO THE THING**

Adapt strategies with stakeholders for different settings and people



How well they **DO THE THING**

Could all settings / clinicians do THE THING the same?

Conclusion and Opportunity - Achieving the Promise of Genomic Screening



Implementation Science provides the tools to achieve the goal to provide equitable benefit for all



Ongoing **Engagement and Co-creation** facilitate equity and improves impact of implementing screening programs



Achieving health benefit from genomic screening is a **Journey**

"Increasing health equity is within reach, if we commit to building capacity and continue to collaborate with multidisciplinary researchers, practitioners both in health and non-health sectors, policy makers, and **most importantly individuals with lived experiences**, with a reframe of our theories, frameworks, and methods with equity at the forefront. **Beginning with the acknowledgement that health is not distributed across all populations equally, we can work collectively to promote a science for implementation that benefits all, with no one left behind**."

Adsul P, Chambers D, Brandt HM, Fernandez ME, Ramanadhan S, Torres E, Leeman J, Baquero B, Fleischer L, Escoffery C, Emmons K, Soler M, Oh A, Korn AR, Wheeler S, Shelton RC. Grounding implementation science in health equity for cancer prevention and control. Implement Sci Commun. 2022 Jun 3;3(1):56. doi: 10.1186/s43058-022-00311-4. PMID: 35659151; PMCID: PMC9164317.